



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA CLIMATE COMMITTEE

Contact: 831.620.2000 www.ci.carmel.ca.us/carmel

All meetings are held in the City Council Chambers
East Side of Monte Verde Street
Between Ocean and 7th Avenues

REGULAR MEETING Thursday, December 17, 2020

3:30 PM

Governor Newsom's Executive Order N-29-20 has allowed local legislative bodies to hold public meetings via teleconference and to make public meetings accessible telephonically or otherwise electronically to all members of the public seeking to observe and to address the local legislative body. Also, see the Order by the Monterey County Public Health Officer issued March 17, 2020. The health and well-being of our residents is the top priority for the City of Carmel-by-the-Sea. To that end, this meeting will be held via teleconference and web-streamed on the City's website ONLY.

To attend via Teleconference; Dial in number +1 (617) 675-4444, PIN: 409 219 623 9330#. The public can also email comments to amartelet@ci.carmel.ca.us. Comments must be received 2 hours before the meeting in order to be provided to the committee. Comments received after that time and up to the beginning of the meeting will be added to the agenda and made part of the record.

CALL TO ORDER

PUBLIC APPEARANCES

Members of the public are entitled to speak on matters of municipal concern not on the agenda during Public Appearances. Each person's comments shall be limited to 3 minutes, or as otherwise established by the Committee. Matters not appearing on Committee's agenda will not receive action at this meeting but may be referred to staff for a future meeting. Persons are not required to give their names, but it is helpful for speakers to state their names so that they may be identified in the minutes of the meeting.

COMMITTEE MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS

ORDERS OF BUSINESS

Orders of Business are agenda items that require Committee discussion, debate, direction to staff, and/or action.

1. Receive a Presentation from the United States Geological Survey on the Coastal Storm Modeling System's analysis of the impacts of storms and sea level rise on the Carmel-by-the-Sea shoreline

2. Receive a Presentation from the Public Works Director on the City's Storm Drain Master Plan
3. Review, provide comments, and/or approve the summary sheet for the Monterey County Office of Emergency Services presentation
4. Provide Updates on the Outreach to Community Organizations and Regional Partners Conducted to Date
5. Review the June 2020 Update to the California Adaptation Planning Guide

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

ADJOURNMENT

This agenda was posted at City Hall, Monte Verde Street between Ocean Avenue and 7th Avenue, outside the Park Branch Library, NE corner of Mission Street and 6th Avenue, the Carmel-by-the-Sea Post Office, 5th Avenue between Dolores Street and San Carlos Street, and the City's webpage <http://www.ci.carmel.ca.us> in accordance with applicable legal requirements.

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL RECEIVED AFTER THE POSTING OF THE AGENDA

Any supplemental writings or documents distributed to a majority of the Climate Committee regarding any item on this agenda, received after the posting of the agenda will be available at the Public Works Department located on the east side of Junipero Street between Fourth and Fifth Avenues during normal business hours.

SPECIAL NOTICES TO PUBLIC

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need special assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact the City Clerk's Office at 831-620-2000 at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure that reasonable arrangements can be made to provide accessibility to the meeting (28CFR 35.102-35.104 ADA Title II).



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Climate Committee

Staff Report

December 17, 2020
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO:	Climate Committee Members
SUBMITTED BY:	Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager
SUBJECT:	Receive a Presentation from the Public Works Director on the City's Storm Drain Master Plan

RECOMMENDATION:

Receive a presentation from the Public Works Director on the City's recently completed Storm Drain Master Plan

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

The Public Works Department completed a Storm Drain Master Plan (SDMP) in 2020. The purpose of the SDMP is to provide an examination of the drainage risks within the City limits and recommend actions necessary to accomplish appropriate level-of-service and reliability for storm drain systems owned by the City. Bob Harary P.E., Public Works Director, will provide a summary of the findings of the SDMP, as well as the recommended capital projects to improve the reliability of the system.

The SDMP can be downloaded at: https://ci.carmel.ca.us/sites/main/files/file-attachments/complete_final_sdmp_report_september_2020_small.pdf?1602098761

FISCAL IMPACT:

ATTACHMENTS:



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Climate Committee

Staff Report

December 17, 2020
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO: Climate Committee Members

SUBMITTED BY: Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager

SUBJECT: Review, provide comments, and/or approve the summary sheet for the Monterey County Office of Emergency Services presentation

RECOMMENDATION:

Review, provide comments, and/or approve the hazard and asset summary sheet for the presentation by the Monterey County Office of Emergency Services at the November 19, 2020 Climate Committee meeting.

Review and approve the revised summary sheet for Community Wildfire Preparedness.

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

At the November 19, 2020 Climate Committee meeting, the Committee heard presentations from the Monterey County Office of Emergency Services (OES) on the 2021 update of the County's Multi-Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan (HMP), and from David Shonman and Greg D'Ambrosio on the impacts of past storms on the Carmel shoreline infrastructure.

A summary sheet for the OES presentation is included as Attachment 1. The summary sheet for the Shonman and D'Ambrosio presentation will be combined with the summary of the USGS presentation on December 17, and reviewed at a subsequent meeting.

Additionally, at the November 19, 2020 meeting, the Climate Committee reviewed the summary sheets for prior presentations by the Monterey Fire Department and the Monterey Chapter of the American Institute of Architects on wildfire vulnerability and preparedness. Committee members recommended combining the two summary sheets into one. The revised summary sheet is included as Attachment 2.

FISCAL IMPACT:

None.

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet for the Multi-Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan

Attachment 2: Community Wildfire Preparedness Summary Sheet



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet for the Multi-Jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan

November 19, 2020

TO:	Climate Committee Members
SUBMITTED BY:	Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager

SUMMARY

Asset: multiple
Hazards: multiple
Version: 1

General Comments and Outlook:

- The Multi-jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan (HMP) was presented by Kelsey Scanlon of the Monterey County Office of Emergency Services. The HMP establishes a broad local vision and guiding principles for reducing hazard risk, and proposes specific mitigation actions to reduce identified vulnerabilities. The plan is due for renewal in 2021.
- This plan helps local jurisdictions comply with the climate change planning requirements of SB 379, and also allows them to be eligible for pre- and post-disaster mitigation project grant funding from the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA).
- Objectives of the HMP include:
 - Protect life and property
 - Minimize economic losses
 - Enhance community resilience
 - Reduce burden on local government and taxpayers
 - Break the cycle of repetitive disaster damages
 - Speed disaster recovery
 - Integrate hazard mitigation planning with other local planning and decision-making
- The HMP addresses the impacts of Climate Change and shares many objectives with Climate Adaptation Plans. Identified hazards that will be exacerbated by Climate Change in Monterey County include: wildfires, flooding, coastal erosion, landslides and debris flows, extreme heat and drought, human health hazards, and mass migration.

Identified Issues / To-do:

- Each of the 12 cities in the County will provide mitigation strategies and projects to include into the HMP. By including projects into the HMP, jurisdictions may be eligible for FEMA grant funding.

Possible Committee Actions

- The Committee could provide feedback and recommendations for hazard mitigation projects to include in the HMP. The Monterey County Office of Emergency Services anticipates soliciting comments and projects in the Spring of 2021.

- Monterey County Hazard Mitigation webpage: <http://www.co.monterey.ca.us/government/departments-a-h/administrative-office/office-of-emergency-services/hazard-mitigation>

History

- Version 1 presented at committee meeting on 12/17/2020



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Hazard and Asset Summary Sheet – Community Wildfire Preparedness

October 15, 2020

TO: Climate Committee Members

SUBMITTED BY: John Hill, Committee Member

SUMMARY

Asset: Public and Private Property, Public Safety

Hazards: Local Fires and Wildfire damage due to accumulated dry fuel & increasing wind and weather events.

Version: 1

General Comments and Outlook: The severity of fires and wildfires in California continues to increase in intensity and occurrence. California had low intensity fires until the logging of old growth forests, the introduction of grazing and invasive grasses, indigenous burning was replaced by fire suppression, and urban sprawl invaded the wildland areas. Community wildfire preparedness is supported by Monterey Fire's Defensible Space Inspection Program and coordination with surrounding fire prevention organizations to limit fire and wildfire risk through planning, prevention, and mitigation. Monterey Fire and the Carmel Public Works Department have working relationships with the Pebble Beach Services District for fire mitigation in Pescadero Canyon, and partner with the Friends of Mission Trail Nature Preserve for fuel reduction in Mission Trail Nature Preserve. CalFire's Fire & Resource Assessment Program (FRAP) and Fire Hazard Severity Zone (FHSZ) maps are available on line with information on forest assessment, fire severity zones, and defensible space. Monterey Fire personnel have inspected and graded all Carmel parcels as pass, pending, or fail. Grading criteria is evolving as knowledge on fire spread is developed. Current criteria is based on dry fuel accumulation, spark arrestors, overhanging tree limbs, etc.

Identified Issues:

- Some northern and eastern areas within City limits are within the Very High Fire Hazard Severity and Wildland Urban Interface (WUI) Zones.
- Some areas within the City limits and adjacent communities have accumulated fuel levels as well as overhead infrastructure (i.e. Mission Trail Park) that present fire and wildfire risks.
- An integrated approach to fire resilience in the landscape along with hardening structures against fire are ways to mitigate fire impact on lives and property.
- Fire resiliency can be controlled by creating defensible space with Fire Defense Zones around structures, an ignition zone (5 feet), a defense zone (30 feet) and reduced fuel zone (100 feet)
- Fuel is affected by the height and placement of plants & their chemical content. Pine forests and Oak woodlands are resilient but dead material and limbed branches in the understory must be maintained.
- Fire retardant plants, trees, and ground covers can absorb heat and fire without burning, trap embers, reduce wind speed, and slow the travel of a fire.
- 9 out of 10 structures lost are due to low intensity ground fire and embers in the 5-foot zone around them. Combustible materials such as decks, wood chips, and plant material should not be located within 5 feet of nor attached to the structure.

- Vents and windows are the most vulnerable areas in a house, gaps in vent screening should be no more than 1/8" maximum and plants should not be located near or below windows. Attachment 2
- The City's Building Department has adopted the California Building Code requirements in the Very High Fire Hazard Zone but the City's planning guidelines currently do not address them or may be in conflict with them.

Possible actions to be recommended in the committee's Final Report

- Carmel City Council consider fire hazard severity and evacuation plans in the safety elements of the General Plan and monitor the level of fire hazards within and surrounding the community. Resolutions and/or Ordinances could include:
 - Documenting the various existing hazards.
 - Assigning staff/council personnel as liaisons to CalFire (Cypress Fire District), and adjacent communities which could threaten Carmel in a wildfire.
 - Assist Monterey Fire in its current efforts in inspecting and identifying fire risks.
 - City Forester consider fire retardant trees and plants in City controlled areas and for tree replacement requirements for private property.
 - Update City Planning guidelines to reflect or not conflict with current California codes (CBC Chapter 7 & CRC R337) in the Very High Fire Hazard Severity (VHFHS) Zone.

REFERENCES

- Fire and Resource Assessment Program (FRAP) ResilientCA.org
- Monterey Fire Defensible Space Inspection Program mry.maps.arcgis.com , monterey.org/fire
- CalFire Defensible Space/Home Hardening readyforwildfire.org
- CalFire Fire Severity Zone Viewer gis.data.ca.gov
- Wildland Urban Interface (WUI) frap.fire.ca.gov
- Every Building's Wildfire Risk in Monterey County defensibleapp.com
- The A.I.A. Designing for Fire Presentation <http://youtu.be/MWslhXidZnc>

History

- Version 2 presented at committee meeting on 12/17/2020



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Climate Committee

Staff Report

December 17, 2020
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO: Climate Committee Members

SUBMITTED BY: Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager

SUBJECT: Provide Updates on the Outreach to Community Organizations and Regional Partners Conducted to Date

RECOMMENDATION:

Committee members will provide updates on the outreach to community organizations and regional partners they have conducted over the past month, and any notable feedback they have received.

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

On February 20, 2020, the Climate Committee started assembling the list of community organizations and regional partners to engage. Included in this process, the Committee assigned outreach leads for each organization.

At the July 16, 2020 Climate Committee meeting, members agreed to start conducting outreach to community organizations and regional partners about the City's project. The updated outreach list is included in Attachment 1. The updated Climate Committee presentation schedule is included in Attachment 2.

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment 1: Community Organizations and Regional Partners
Attachment 2: Updated Climate Committee Presentation Schedule

Community Organizations and Regional Partners to Engage
City of Carmel-by-the-Sea Climate Project
December 2020

	ORGANIZATION	Topic (s)	Contact Persons	Committee Lead	Present to	Hear from	Contacted?
	Utilities						
1*	<i>Carmel Area Wastewater District</i>	<i>Sewer system Wastewater Treatment Facility</i>	<i>Barbara Buikema, Daryl Lauer</i>	<i>Jeff Baron, Agnes Martelet</i>		X	Y
2	Central Coast Community Energy (was Monterey Bay Community Power)	Energy supply	Dan Bertoldi (dbertoldi@mbcommunitypower.org) J.R. Killigrew (jkilligrew@mbcommunitypower.org)	Evan Kort, Agnes Martelet		X	Y
3	Cal Am	Water supply		Michael LePage		X	
4	Monterey Peninsula Water Management District	Water supply	Stephanie Locke	Michael LePage		X	Y
5	GreenWaste Recovery	Waste management and recycling	Jim Moresco	Carrie Theis, Agnes Martelet			
6	Monterey Regional Waste Management District	Waste management and recycling	Tim Flanagan	Carrie Theis		X	Y
7	PG&E	Energy supply	Gina Arnold Teri Vetere	Carrie Theis, Jeff Baron		X	Y
	Professional Organizations						
1	<i>California AIA</i>	<i>Built environment resilience</i>	<i>Libby Barnes</i>	<i>John Hill</i>		X	Y
2	Chamber of Commerce	Local business, tourism	Jenny McMurdo	Carrie Theis	X		Y
3	Monterey County Association of Realtors	Sea Level Rise Wildfire risk	Ben Beasley	Scott Lonergan, LaNette Zimmerman	X		Y
4	MCCVB	Visitors		Carrie Theis			
5	Visit Carmel	Visitors / local business	Amy Herzog	Carrie Theis			

	ORGANIZATION	Topic (s)	Contact Persons	Committee Lead	Present to	Hear from	Contacted?
6	Sunset Center	Resilience	Christine Sandin	LaNette Zimmerman			
Local Community Groups							
1	<i>Carmel Residents Association</i>	<i>Community resilience Climate action</i>	<i>Fred Bologna Nancy Twomey</i>	<i>Jeff Baron</i>	X		Y
2	<i>Carmel Rotary Club</i>	<i>Community resilience Climate action</i>	<i>Susan Prest</i>	<i>Carrie Theis, Jeff Baron</i>	X		Y
3	Carmel Lions Club	Community resilience Climate action	Heidy Mozingo	Carrie Theis	X		
4	Friends of Carmel Forest	Urban forest	Ramie Allard	Scott Lonergan	X		
5	<i>Friends of MTNP</i>	<i>Wildfire risk Sensitive habitats</i>	<i>Skip Lloyd</i>	<i>Scott Lonergan</i>	X		Y
6	Del Monte Forest Conservancy	Wildfire risk		Scott Lonergan			Y
7	Landwatch	Transportation, housing	Mike DeLapa	Jeff Baron		X	Y
8	Sustainable Carmel	Climate action	Ellen Gannon	Agnes Martelet	X		
9	Church auxiliaries	Community resilience		LaNette Zimmerman			Y
10	Heritage Society	Community resilience	Karl Iverson	Michael LePage			
11	Forest Theater Guild	Community resilience	Steven Moore	LaNette Zimmerman, Carrie Theis			
12	PacRep	Community resilience	Steven Moore	LaNette Zimmerman, Carrie Theis			
13	Carmel Women's Club	Community resilience Climate action	Nancy Twomey	Jeff Baron			
City Departments							
1	Police	Emergency preparedness Transportation	Paul Tomasi	Agnes Martelet			Y
2	<i>Fire</i>	<i>Emergency preparedness</i>	<i>Carmyn Prew, Sichel Young</i>	<i>John Hill</i>		X	Y
3	<i>Forestry Division (PW)</i>	<i>Urban forest Sensitive habitats</i>	<i>Sara Davis</i>	<i>Agnes Martelet</i>		X	Y

	ORGANIZATION	Topic (s)	Contact Persons	Committee Lead	Present to	Hear from	Contacted?
4	Library	Historic events	Katie O'Connell	Evan Kort			Y
City Commissions							
1	<i>Forest & Beach Commission</i>	<i>Sea Level Rise Urban forest Sensitive habitats Climate action</i>		<i>Scott Lonergan</i>	X		Y
2	Planning Commission	Built environment resilience Climate action		Michael LePage	X		
3	City Traffic Safety Committee	Transportation		Agnes Martelet			Y
Federal / State / Regional Agencies							
1	AMBAG	Climate Action Transportation	Elisabeth Bertrand	Agnes Martelet	X	X	Y
2	<i>USGS</i>	<i>Sea Level Rise</i>	<i>Patrick Barnard</i>	<i>Agnes Martelet</i>	X	X	Y
3	CalFire	Wildfire risk and resilience Urban forest management	John Reynolds	John Hill	X		Y
4	CA Department of Insurance	Wildfire risk / home insurability	Ricardo Laura	John Hill			Y
5	Fire Safe Council for Monterey County	Michael Emmett		John Hill			Y
6	California Coastal Commission	Sea Level Rise		Jeff Baron / Agnes Martelet		X	
7	IRWMP Group	Water supply Watershed / storm water projects		Michael LePage			
8	<i>Monterey County (OES)</i>	<i>Resilience planning</i>	<i>Kelsey Scanlon</i>	<i>Agnes Martelet</i>		X	Y
9	<i>Monterey County</i>	<i>Sustainability Climate Action</i>	<i>Ashley Paulsworth</i>	<i>Agnes Martelet</i>		X	Y
10	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary (NOAA)	Marine Sanctuary impacts Carmel Beach	Karen Grimmer	Agnes Martelet			Y
11	Transportation Agency of Monterey County	Transportation		Jeff Baron			

	ORGANIZATION	Topic (s)	Contact Persons	Committee Lead	Present to	Hear from	Contacted?
12	MST	Transportation		Jeff Baron		X	
13	US Navy / Coast Guard	Coastal impacts		Carrie Theis			
Educational Groups							
1	Carmel High School Environmental Club	Internships Climate Action partnership / Green Schools	Ellen Gannon	LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			Y
2	<i>Stevenson, York, Santa Catalina</i>	<i>Climate Action partnership / Green Schools</i>		<i>LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan</i>			Y
3	Youth Center	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			
4	CSUMB	Internships Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			Y
5	MPCC	Internships Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			
6	MIISS	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools		LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			Y
7	NPS	Climate Action partnership / Green Schools	Ann E. Rondeau (ret.) (pao@nps.edu)	LaNette Zimmerman, Scott Lonergan			
Regional Non-Profit Organizations							
1	Monterey Bay Aquarium	Marine Sanctuary impacts Climate Action Support		Carrie Theis			
2	Ecology Action	Climate Action Support	Kirsten Liske	Agnes Martelet			
Other Stakeholders							
1	Pebble Beach Company	Bluffs / Seawalls / Beach Regional transportation Emergency response		Jeff Baron / Carrie Theis	X		

	ORGANIZATION	Topic (s)	Contact Persons	Committee Lead	Present to	Hear from	Contacted?
2	<i>Principals Involved in 1983 response; authors of the CBTS Shoreline Management Plan</i>	<i>Bluffs / Seawalls / Beach</i>	<i>Greg D'Ambrosio (past Assistant City Administrator); David Shonman (Coastal Biologist)</i>	<i>Evan Kort, Scott Lonergan</i>		X	Y
3	Cities with similar challenges (e.g. PG, Monterey, Seaside, Pacifica, Del Mar, Malibu, Dana Point, Imperial Beach)			Jeff Baron / Carrie Theis			

**Grey italics denote presentations that have already occurred*

Climate Committee
Presentation Schedule
12/17/2020

Climate Committee Meeting Date	Presenters
10/15/2020	Sara Davis – Forestry Science and Adapting Carmel’s Urban Forest to Climate Change Monterey Fire – Defensible Space Inspection Program, community resilience to wildfires
11/19/2020	Monterey County Office of Emergency Services (confirmed) – Multi-jurisdictional Hazard Mitigation Plan Greg D’Ambrosio, David Shonman – Carmel coastal processes and damage caused by previous storms
12/17/2020	United States Geological Survey (confirmed) – CosMos Modeling of Sea Level Rise and storm impacts on Carmel coast Carmel Public Works (confirmed) – Storm Drain Master Plan and readiness of drainage system for climate change
1/21/2021	Monterey Regional Waste Management District (confirmed) PG&E (pending confirmation) – Power grid resilience Monterey Peninsula Water Management District (confirmed) – Water supply resilience
2/18/2021	Association of Monterey Bay Area Governments (pending confirmation) – results of 2018 greenhouse gas inventory Central Coast Community Energy (was Monterey Bay Community Power, pending confirmation) – climate action efforts, new procurement policy, and how that will affect our Climate Action Plan

Not yet on the schedule

- Landwatch
- California Coastal Commission
- Monterey-Salinas Transit
- Monterey Bay Sanctuary



CITY OF CARMEL-BY-THE-SEA

Climate Committee

Staff Report

December 17, 2020
ORDERS OF BUSINESS

TO: Climate Committee Members

SUBMITTED BY: Agnes Martelet, Environmental Compliance Manager

SUBJECT: Review the June 2020 Update to the California Adaptation Planning Guide

RECOMMENDATION:

Review the June 2020 Update to the California Adaptation Planning Guide

BACKGROUND/SUMMARY:

In 2012, the Governor's Office of Planning and Research released the first California Adaptation Planning Guide (APG 1.0). The City has used the framework provided in the APG 1.0 to develop the workplan for our climate adaptation project.

In June 2020, the California Office of Emergency Services (CalOES) released the 2020 update of the Adaptation Planning Guide (APG 2.0). APG 2.0 uses the same framework as APG 1.0 but provides significant additional resources and updated information. The APG 2.0 can be viewed and downloaded at: <https://www.caloes.ca.gov/cal-oes-divisions/hazard-mitigation/hazard-mitigation-planning/california-climate-adaptation>

Staff will provide a brief update on the additional and updated resources provided in the updated guide.

FISCAL IMPACT:

N/A

ATTACHMENTS: